

Dunedin temperature analysis technical notes

Site 5→6, 1997

Comparison with all stations that were considered:

```
annualTempDiff = CalculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinMusselburgh, CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinMusselburghEws,
[stnInvercargillAero,stnQueenstown,stnPalmerstonEstimate,stnTimaru2Estimate,stnWinchmoreEWS,stnAshburtonCouncil
Estimate,stnWellingtonKelburn], 1997, 10, -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=0)

***** SUMMARY *****
Year of site change : 1997
Candidate station before site change : Dunedin,Musselburgh ( 5402, I50951)
Candidate station after site change : Dunedin, Musselburgh Ews (15752, I50954)
|----- Mean -----| |----- Maximum -----| |----- Minimum -----|
Station Agent # Yrs Shift Sig. Corr. Shift Sig. Corr. Shift Sig. Corr.
Candidate 10/10 0.295 0.1709 0.457 0.0808 0.119 0.5352
Reference Stations:
Invercargill Aero 5814 10/10 -0.160 0.0738 0.864 0.048 0.7567 0.631 -0.381 0.0044 0.877
Queenstown 5446 10/10 -0.212 0.0521 0.841 -0.307 0.0891 0.701 -0.134 0.1667 0.882
Palmerston 5323 10/10 0.045 0.5442 0.887 0.127 0.1493 0.913 -0.057 0.6313 0.745
Timaru 2 5095 10/10 -0.001 0.9878 0.816 0.088 0.4367 0.772 -0.100 0.4490 0.725
Winchmore Ews 4764 10/10 -0.087 0.4458 0.696 -0.097 0.4895 0.730 -0.083 0.4636 0.755
Ashburton Council 4778 10/10 -0.177 0.0643 0.822 0.044 0.7146 0.799 -0.420 0.0005 0.755
Wellington,Kelburn 3385 10/ 7 -0.090 0.3971 0.801 -0.047 0.7037 0.812 -0.151 0.3069 0.465
Mean (Ref. Stations) -0.098 -0.020 -0.190
```

Queenstown was rejected because: it is geographically dissimilar to Dunedin, being in a mountain valley; its correlation is not especially high (though higher than Timaru 2 and Ashburton); the multi-decade trend is much higher than at Dunedin.

Winchmore was rejected because of low correlation.

Wellington, Kelburn was rejected because correlation was low and only 7 years available after the change.

The final comparison command is

```
annualTempDiff = CalculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinMusselburgh, CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinMusselburghEws,
[stnInvercargillAero,stnPalmerstonEstimate,stnTimaru2Estimate,stnAshburtonCouncilEstimate], 1997, 10, -1,
INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=0)
```

```
***** SUMMARY *****
```

Year of site change	:	1997									
Candidate station before site change	:	Dunedin,Musselburgh (5402, I50951)									
Candidate station after site change	:	Dunedin, Musselburgh Ews (15752, I50954)									
Station	Agent	# Yrs	Mean	Maximum	Minimum						
Candidate		10/10	Shift	Shift	Shift	Sig.					
Reference Stations:			Sig.	Sig.	Sig.	Corr.					
Invercargill Aero	5814	10/10	-0.160	0.0738	0.864	0.048	0.7567	0.631	-0.381	0.0044	0.877
Palmerston	5323	10/10	0.045	0.5442	0.887	0.127	0.1493	0.913	-0.057	0.6313	0.745
Timaru 2	5095	10/10	-0.001	0.9878	0.816	0.088	0.4367	0.772	-0.100	0.4490	0.725
Ashburton Council	4778	10/10	-0.177	0.0643	0.822	0.044	0.7146	0.799	-0.420	0.0005	0.755
Mean (Ref. Stations)			-0.073			0.077			-0.240		

Site 4→5, 1960

Stations considered were Invercargill Aero, Gore, Alexandra, Waimate, Adair and Wellington Kelburn. Gore had an unspecified site change in August 1965. Alexandra had a site change ("new site 400 yds S of previous site")in September 1963.

Command is

```
annualTempDiff = CalculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinMusselburghEstimate,
[stnInvercargillAeroEstimate,stnWaimate,stnAdair,stnWellingtonKelburn], 1960, 10, -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=0)
```

Summary output is

***** SUMMARY *****											
Year of site change	:	1960									
Candidate station before site change	:	Dunedin,Musselburgh (5402, I50951)									
Candidate station after site change	:	Dunedin,Musselburgh (5402, I50951)									
Station	Agent	# Yrs	Mean	Maximum	Minimum						
Candidate		10/10	Shift	Shift	Shift	Sig.					
Reference Stations:			Sig.	Sig.	Sig.	Corr.					
Invercargill Aero	5814	10/10	-0.056	0.4795	0.905	-0.199	0.1181	0.860	0.078	0.4546	0.716
Waimate	5102	10/10	-0.072	0.3121	0.902	-0.143	0.2289	0.733	-0.006	0.9494	0.864
Adair	5088	10/10	-0.057	0.5286	0.854	-0.285	0.0670	0.670	0.173	0.0285	0.919
Wellington,Kelburn	3385	10/10	-0.089	0.4140	0.829	-0.453	0.0099	0.646	0.276	0.0061	0.870
Mean (Ref. Stations)			-0.068			-0.270			0.130		

Site 3→4, 1947

As discussed in the comments in bDunedin.pro and in the report, the 2→3 and 3→4 site changes are a pair, bracketing the relatively brief occupation of the cool site 3 (Beta St). I considered a comprehensive list of 11 potential reference sites bracketing *both* changes. Of these, five were rejected at the first cut:

- Naseby Forest 1 (5257): forest station subject to tree-growth effects; high altitude
- Fairlie (4991): high altitude (306 m); in the region of inland Canterbury where the correlation is weak; large variability in temperature difference in the early 1930s
- Appleby (4239): distant, but possibly should have made the short list
- Ashburton Council (4778): trends upwards after 1947 compared with Musselburgh, leading to an implausibly small offset at 1947
- Hamilton Ruakura (2101): distant, low correlation

Another 3 made the short-list 6 and are mentioned in the report

- Queenstown (5446): high altitude (329 m) & climatically dissimilar
- Christchurch Gardens (4858)
- Blenheim (4331)

And 3 are shown in the report and used to calculate the adjustment

- East Gore (5759)
- Alexandra (5576)
- Wellington Kelburn (3385)

Comparison with all stations:

```
comp_all =
[stnEastGoreEstimate, stnQueenstownEstimate, stnAlexandraEstimate, stnNasebyForest1Estimate, stnFairlieEstimate, stn
AshburtonCouncilEstimate, stnBlenheim, stnApplebyEstimate, stnChristchurchGardens, stnWellingtonKelburn, stnHamilton
RuakuraEstimate]

annualTempDiff = CalculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinBetaStEstimate,
CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinMusselburghEstimate, comp_all, 1947, [6,10], -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=0)
```

Summary output is

***** SUMMARY *****		
Year of site change	:	1947

Candidate station before site change :	Dunedin,Beta St	(5379, I50856)								
Candidate station after site change :	Dunedin,Musselburgh	(5402, I50951)								
Station Candidate Reference Stations:	Agent # Yrs	Mean	Maximum	Minimum						
East Gore	5759 6/10	Shift 1.320	Sig. 0.0000	Corr. 0.853	Shift 1.013	Sig. 0.0000	Corr. 0.828	Shift 0.291	Sig. 0.0234	Corr. 0.597
Queenstown	5446 6/ 9	0.659	0.0002	0.776	0.762	0.0003	0.652	0.556	0.0007	0.561
Alexandra	5576 6/10	0.632	0.0001	0.854	0.522	0.0000	0.855	0.739	0.0007	0.527
Naseby Forest 1	5257 6/10	1.184	0.0000	0.871	1.272	0.0000	0.845	1.093	0.0000	0.658
Fairlie	4991 6/10	0.794	0.0002	0.821	0.654	0.0130	0.736	0.923	0.0000	0.732
Ashburton Council	4778 6/10	0.401	0.0004	0.804	0.278	0.1019	0.751	0.523	0.0009	0.805
Blenheim	4331 6/10	0.687	0.0000	0.788	1.375	0.0000	0.669	-0.019	0.8258	0.720
Appleby	4239 6/10	0.867	0.0001	0.821	1.072	0.0002	0.783	0.655	0.0000	0.573
Christchurch Garden	4858 6/10	0.665	0.0000	0.729	0.589	0.0102	0.761	0.738	0.0000	0.725
Wellington,Kelburn	3385 6/10	0.885	0.0000	0.843	1.255	0.0000	0.637	0.491	0.0000	0.850
Hamilton, Ruakura	2101 6/10	1.152	0.0003	0.678	1.131	0.0000	0.608	1.151	0.0026	0.544
Mean (Ref. Stations)		0.780			0.902			0.649		

The short-list 6 (mentioned in the report):

```
comp_6 =
[stnEastGoreEstimate, stnAlexandraEstimate, stnQueenstownEstimate, stnChristchurchGardens, stnBlenheim, stnWellington
nKelburn]

annualTempDiff = CalculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinBetaStEstimate,
CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinMusselburghEstimate, comp_6, 1947, [6,10], -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=0)
```

Summary output is

Year of site change	:	1947								
Candidate station before site change :	Dunedin,Beta St	(5379, I50856)								
Candidate station after site change :	Dunedin,Musselburgh	(5402, I50951)								
Station Candidate Reference Stations:	Agent # Yrs	Mean	Maximum	Minimum						
East Gore	5759 6/10	Shift 1.320	Sig. 0.0000	Corr. 0.853	Shift 1.013	Sig. 0.0000	Corr. 0.828	Shift 0.291	Sig. 0.0234	Corr. 0.597
Alexandra	5576 6/10	0.632	0.0001	0.854	0.522	0.0000	0.855	0.739	0.0007	0.527
Queenstown	5446 6/ 9	0.659	0.0002	0.776	0.762	0.0003	0.652	0.556	0.0007	0.561
Christchurch Garden	4858 6/10	0.665	0.0000	0.729	0.589	0.0102	0.761	0.738	0.0000	0.725
Blenheim	4331 6/10	0.687	0.0000	0.788	1.375	0.0000	0.669	-0.019	0.8258	0.720
Wellington,Kelburn	3385 6/10	0.885	0.0000	0.843	1.255	0.0000	0.637	0.491	0.0000	0.850
Mean (Ref. Stations)		0.698			0.919			0.466		

The final 3:

```
comp_3 = [stnEastGoreEstimate,stnAlexandraEstimate,stnWellingtonKelburn]

annualTempDiff = calculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinBetaStEstimate,
    CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinMusselburghEstimate, comp_3, 1947, [6,10], -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=0)
```

Summary output is

***** SUMMARY *****											
Year of site change	1947										
Candidate station before site change	Dunedin,Beta St (5379, I50856)										
Candidate station after site change	Dunedin,Musselburgh (5402, I50951)										
Station	Agent	# Yrs	Mean			Maximum			Minimum		
Candidate		6/10	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.
Reference Stations:											
East Gore	5759	6/10	0.657	0.0001	0.853	1.013	0.0000	0.828	0.291	0.0234	0.597
Alexandra	5576	6/10	0.632	0.0001	0.854	0.522	0.0000	0.855	0.739	0.0007	0.527
Wellington,Kelburn	3385	6/10	0.885	0.0000	0.843	1.255	0.0000	0.637	0.491	0.0000	0.850
Mean (Ref. Stations)			0.725			0.930			0.507		

Site 2→3, 1941-ish

All comparison stations

```
comp_all =
[stnEastGoreEstimate,stnQueenstownEstimate,stnAlexandraEstimate,stnNasebyForest1Estimate,stnFairlieEstimate,stn
AshburtonCouncilEstimate,stnBlenheim,stnApplebyEstimate,stnChristchurchGardens,stnWellingtonKelburn,stnHamilton
RuakuraEstimate]

annualTempDiff = calculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinBtlGardens, CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinBetaStEstimate,
    comp_all, 1941, [10,6], -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=1)
```

Output:

***** SUMMARY *****											
Year of site change	1941										
Candidate station before site change	Dunedin, Btl Gardens (5375, I50852)										
Candidate station after site change	Dunedin,Beta St (5379, I50856)										
Station	Agent	# Yrs	Mean			Maximum			Minimum		
Candidate		10/ 6	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.
Reference Stations:											

East Gore	5759	9/ 6	-0.634	0.0001	0.932	-0.657	0.0015	0.854	-0.613	0.0003	0.816
Queenstown	5446	10/ 6	-0.647	0.0002	0.776	-1.164	0.0000	0.622	-0.139	0.2792	0.774
Alexandra	5576	10/ 6	-0.638	0.0001	0.851	-1.228	0.0000	0.718	-0.055	0.7043	0.684
Naseby Forest 1	5257	10/ 6	-0.699	0.0000	0.733	-0.922	0.0000	0.554	-0.510	0.0057	0.546
Fairlie	4991	10/ 6	-0.365	0.0402	0.720	-0.702	0.0315	0.556	-0.025	0.7506	0.830
Ashburton Council	4778	10/ 6	-0.875	0.0000	0.896	-1.412	0.0000	0.699	-0.353	0.0088	0.833
Blenheim	4331	8/ 6	-0.447	0.0014	0.930	-0.987	0.0000	0.816	0.103	0.4974	0.884
Appleby	4239	9/ 6	-0.764	0.0001	0.934	-1.336	0.0000	0.837	-0.176	0.1441	0.901
Christchurch Garden	4858	10/ 6	-0.956	0.0000	0.951	-1.604	0.0000	0.869	-0.314	0.0026	0.941
Wellington, Kelburn	3385	10/ 6	-0.918	0.0000	0.946	-1.390	0.0000	0.855	-0.425	0.0001	0.924
Hamilton, Ruakura	2101	10/ 6	-0.945	0.0008	0.835	-0.899	0.0014	0.637	-0.975	0.0067	0.794
Mean (Ref. Stations)				-0.717			-1.118			-0.317	

The short-list 6

```
comp_6 =
[stnEastGoreEstimate, stnAlexandraEstimate, stnQueenstownEstimate, stnChristchurchGardens, stnBlenheim, stnWellington
nKelburn]

annualTempDiff = calculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinBtlGardens, CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinBetaStEstimate,
comp_6, 1941, [10,6], -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=1)
```

Output:

***** SUMMARY *****											
Year of site change			1941								
Candidate station before site change			Dunedin, Btl Gardens (5375, I50852)								
Candidate station after site change			Dunedin, Beta St (5379, I50856)								
Station	Agent	# Yrs	Mean			Maximum			Minimum		
			Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.
Candidate		10/ 6	-1.042	0.0000		-1.523	0.0000		-0.558	0.0053	
Reference Stations:											
East Gore	5759	9/ 6	-0.634	0.0001	0.932	-0.657	0.0015	0.854	-0.613	0.0003	0.816
Alexandra	5576	10/ 6	-0.638	0.0001	0.851	-1.228	0.0000	0.718	-0.055	0.7043	0.684
Queenstown	5446	10/ 6	-0.647	0.0002	0.776	-1.164	0.0000	0.622	-0.139	0.2792	0.774
Christchurch Garden	4858	10/ 6	-0.956	0.0000	0.951	-1.604	0.0000	0.869	-0.314	0.0026	0.941
Blenheim	4331	8/ 6	-0.447	0.0014	0.930	-0.987	0.0000	0.816	0.103	0.4974	0.884
Wellington, Kelburn	3385	10/ 6	-0.918	0.0000	0.946	-1.390	0.0000	0.855	-0.425	0.0001	0.924
Mean (Ref. Stations)			-0.707			-1.172			-0.241		

The final 3

```
comp_3 = [stnEastGoreEstimate, stnAlexandraEstimate, stnWellingtonKelburn]
```

```
annualTempDiff = calculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinBtlGardens, CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinBetaStEstimate,
comp_3, 1941, [10,6], -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=1)
```

Output:

```
***** SUMMARY *****
Year of site change : 1941
Candidate station before site change : Dunedin, Btl Gardens ( 5375, I50852)
Candidate station after site change : Dunedin,Beta St ( 5379, I50856)
Station Agent # Yrs |----- Mean -----| |----- Maximum -----| |----- Minimum -----|
Candidate 10/ 6 Shift Sig. Corr. Shift Sig. Corr. Shift Sig. Corr.
Reference Stations:
East Gore 5759 9/ 6 -0.634 0.0001 0.932 -0.657 0.0015 0.854 -0.613 0.0003 0.816
Alexandra 5576 10/ 6 -0.638 0.0001 0.851 -1.228 0.0000 0.718 -0.055 0.7043 0.684
Wellington,Kelburn 3385 10/ 6 -0.918 0.0000 0.946 -1.390 0.0000 0.855 -0.425 0.0001 0.924
Mean (Ref. Stations) -0.730 -1.092 -0.364
```

There is an independent estimate of the 2→3 change from the 25-month overlap period, with the command

```
annualTempDiff = calculateOverlapTempDiff(stnDunedinBetaSt, stnDunedinBtlGardens, statsCodeMeanAirTemp, [[1940,
10], [1942, 11]], all_months = 1)
```

which gives the result

```
Candidate station : I50856, 5379, Dunedin,Beta St
Reference station : I50852, 5375, Dunedin, Btl Gardens
** Temperature statistic to be analysed : 02, Annual Statistics - Mean Air Temperature
Overlapping years of observation ( 1) : 1941
Candidate ann. mean temp. during overlap : 9.758 9.758
Reference ann. mean temp. during overlap : 10.475 10.475
Diff. in ann. mean temp. during overlap : -0.717 -0.717
(Difference = Candidate minus Reference)
Correlation during overlapping years : NaN
Mean annual difference in temperature : -0.717 (Cand. minus Ref.)
** Temperature statistic to be analysed : [02, Monthly Statistics - Mean Air Temperature]
Candidate Mean Air Temperature (C) : 10.040
Reference Mean Air Temperature (C) : 10.728
Temperatures analysed in all overlapping months from October 1940 to November 1942.
Overlapping months ( 25) : October 1940 - November 1942
Correlation during overlapping months : 0.997
Mean monthly difference in temperature : -0.688 (Cand. minus Ref.)
t-test statistics [tm_test(), paired samples] using null hypothesis H0 : zero difference in means
t-stat. / prob. larger abs. t. : -13.823244 / 0.000000
```

So this agrees pretty well with the value from the reference comparison.

Is there any indication of a change of ~ 0.6 in 1942, as originally inferred from a comparison of NZT7 with the original data?

***** SUMMARY *****											
Year of site change			1943								
Candidate station before site change			Dunedin,Beta St			(5379, I50856)					
Candidate station after site change			Dunedin,Beta St			(5379, I50856)					
Station	Agent	# Yrs	Mean			Maximum			Minimum		
Candidate		2/ 4	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.
Reference Stations:											
East Gore	5759	2/ 4	-0.092	0.6295	0.309	-0.131	0.5040	0.613	-0.071	0.6920	-0.101
Queenstown	5446	2/ 4	-0.102	0.7643	0.051	-0.198	0.6785	0.263	-0.050	0.8205	-0.247
Alexandra	5576	2/ 4	0.002	0.9887	0.426	0.062	0.7464	0.733	-0.106	0.6130	0.099
Naseby Forest 1	5257	2/ 4	-0.051	0.6358	0.696	0.157	0.4432	0.659	-0.294	0.2046	0.380
Appleby	4239	2/ 4	-0.416	0.0079	0.865	-0.632	0.0984	0.800	-0.213	0.1268	0.741
Wellington,Kelburn	3385	2/ 4	-0.269	0.1076	0.813	-0.533	0.0603	0.765	-0.044	0.4650	0.718
Hamilton, Ruakura	2101	2/ 4	-0.490	0.0801	0.513	-0.465	0.0287	0.782	-0.567	0.1788	0.132
Mean (Ref. Stations)			-0.202			-0.248			-0.192		

No!

Site 1→2, 1913

For the change from sites 1 to 2 (Leith Valley 5380 to Botanical Gardens 5375) in 1913, Andrew Tait suggested Tapanui, Ranfurly, Lincoln and Invercargill. These are discussed (and all rejected) below.

Note that the temperature record from Dunedin Botanical Gardens has a sharp downward dip in 1921, one that is not matched by any of the other stations. This results from bad maximum temperatures from April to August (by my estimation), documented by Fouhy et al (1992). This has been corrected in the composite time series, but the comparison period for the site 1→2 change has been reduced to avoid using 1921 data.

Possible comparison stations

- Comparison with Tapanui gives a large positive shift (1.88), with the graph showing a fairly large negative difference in 1910. Station history records that thermometers and screen were not standard and changed in 1910. Reject.
- Comparison with Ranfurly, Eweburn gives a large negative shift (-2.21), with the graph showing a big shift in mean temperate at Ranfurly, Eweburn between 1915 and 1918: clearly bad data.
- Comparison with Lincoln gives a moderate positive shift (0.697), but note that the NZT7 documentation shows changes in the adjustment at 1905 and 1915: were these related to the growth of shelter belts documented by Fouhy et al (1992)? Reject.

- Invercargill has only 2 or 3 years before the change and 1905 looks very suspicious. Reject.
- Waimate: the CliDB station history documents several station changes with large altitude differences, up to 200 m. Reject.
- The Levin MAF station history does not record site changes (which doesn't mean there weren't any) but overall site exposure is good. The Levin MAF data start in 1905 (so only 7 years before the change) and there is a gap from 1913 to 1918. Reject.
- Timaru Gardens: the CliDB station history documents several station changes; there are only 2 years before change. Reject.
- Queenstown looked possible but had no data between 1881 and 1929. No.
- East Gore was open from 1907 but changed site ~ 1914.
- Whakarewarewa: correlation is low and it's very distant and inland. Reject.
- New Plymouth looked promising, but there's a data gap 1914–1922.
- Comparison with Auckland Albert Park gives a smallish positive shift (0.547) Correlation is reasonably high. There was a site change in 1909, from Museum (60 m) to Albert Park (49 m)—probably not too big a deal. Accept with temperatures before 1909 shifted by -0.09 C, as estimated by the Auckland document.
- Nelson: looks OK
- Christchurch Gardens: looks OK. High correlation.

Command is

```
annualTempDiff = CalculateAnnualTempChangeRef(stnDunedinLeithvalleyEstimate,
CANDIDATE_AFTER=stnDunedinBtlGardens, [stnNelson,stnChristchurchGardensEstimate,stnAucklandAlbertParkAdjust],
1913, 8, -1, INCLUDE_YEAR_CHANGE=1)
```

Summary output is

***** SUMMARY *****											
Year of site change		:		1913							
Candidate station before site change		:		Dunedin, Leith Valley		(5380, I50857)					
Candidate station after site change		:		Dunedin, Btl Gardens		(5375, I50852)					
Station	Agent	# Yrs	Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Mean		Maximum		Minimum	
						Shift	Sig.	Corr.	Shift	Sig.	Corr.
Candidate		8/ 8	0.574	0.0488		0.655	0.0643		0.485	0.0850	
Reference Stations:											

Nelson	4244	5/ 7	0.345	0.0479	0.855	0.725	0.0557	0.571	-0.029	0.9379	0.818
Christchurch Garden	4858	8/ 8	0.194	0.0027	0.974	0.292	0.0727	0.873	0.089	0.6336	0.882
Auckland,Albert Par	1427	7/ 8	0.581	0.0002	0.863	0.657	0.0052	0.733	0.579	0.0062	0.848
Mean (Ref. Stations)			0.373			0.558			0.213		